

# Logic Programming

Georg Moser

Institute of Computer Science @ UIBK

Summer 2015



# Summary of Last Lecture

## Definition

the **time complexity** of a (Prolog) program expresses the runtime of a program as a function of the size of its input

## Definition

the **space complexity** of a (Prolog) program expresses the memory requirement of a program as a function of the size of its input

## Observations

- space usage depends on the depth of recursion
- if full unification is not employed, the number of reductions asymptotically bounds the runtime
- in general size of search space and size of input terms needs to be taken into account, even for measuring time

# Howto Improve Performance

## Suggestion ①

use better algorithms

## Suggestion ②

tuning, via:

- 1 good goal order
- 2 elimination of (unwanted) nondeterminism by using explicit conditions and cuts
- 3 exploit clause indexing (order arguments suitably)  
**indexing** performs static analysis to detect clauses which are applicable for reduction

# Outline of the Lecture

## Logic Programs

introduction, basic constructs, database and recursive programming, theory of logic programs

## The Prolog Language

programming in pure prolog, arithmetic, structure inspection, meta-logical predicates, cuts, extra-logical predicates, how to program efficiently

## Advanced Prolog Programming Techniques

nondeterministic programming, incomplete data structures, definite clause grammars, meta-programming, constraint logic programming

# Outline of the Lecture

## Logic Programs

introduction, basic constructs, database and recursive programming, theory of logic programs

## The Prolog Language

programming in pure prolog, arithmetic, structure inspection, meta-logical predicates, cuts, extra-logical predicates, how to program efficiently

## Advanced Prolog Programming Techniques

nondeterministic programming, incomplete data structures, definite clause grammars, meta-programming, constraint logic programming

# Generate and Test

## Example

```
map(test, [region(a,A,[B,C,D]), region(b,B,[A,C,E]),  
          region(c,C,[A,B,D,E,F]), region(d,D,[A,C,F]),  
          region(e,E,[B,C,F]), region(f,F,[C,D,E])]).
```

# Generate and Test

## Example

```
map(test,[region(a,A,[B,C,D]), region(b,B,[A,C,E]),
         region(c,C,[A,B,D,E,F]), region(d,D,[A,C,F]),
         region(e,E,[B,C,F]), region(f,F,[C,D,E]))).
```

```
colour_map([Region|Regions], Colours) :-
    colour_region(Region,Colours),
    colour_map(Regions,Colours).
colour_map([],Colours).
```

# Generate and Test

## Example

```
map(test,[region(a,A,[B,C,D]), region(b,B,[A,C,E]),
         region(c,C,[A,B,D,E,F]), region(d,D,[A,C,F]),
         region(e,E,[B,C,F]), region(f,F,[C,D,E]))).

colour_map([Region|Regions], Colours) :-
    colour_region(Region,Colours),
    colour_map(Regions,Colours).
colour_map([],Colours).

colour_region(region(Name,Colour,Neighbours), Colours) :-
    select(Colour,Colours,Colours1),
    members(Neighbours,Colours1).
```



# Generate and Test

## Example

```
map(test,[region(a,A,[B,C,D]), region(b,B,[A,C,E]),
         region(c,C,[A,B,D,E,F]), region(d,D,[A,C,F]),
         region(e,E,[B,C,F]), region(f,F,[C,D,E]))).

colour_map([Region|Regions], Colours) :-
    colour_region(Region,Colours),
    colour_map(Regions,Colours).
colour_map([],Colours).

colour_region(region(Name,Colour,Neighbours), Colours) :-
    select(Colour,Colours,Colours1),
    members(Neighbours,Colours1).

test_colour(Name,Map) :-
    map(Name,Map),
    colours(Name,Colours),
    colour_map(Map,Colours).
```

# Howto Test for Variants

## Example

```
numbervars('$VAR'(N),N,N1) :- N1 is N+1.
numbervars(Term,N1,N2) :-
    nonvar(Term), functor(Term,Name,N),
    numbervars(0,N,Term,N1,N2).
numbervars(N,N,Term,N1,N1).
numbervars(I,N,Term,N1,N3) :-
    I < N, I1 is I+1, arg(I1,Term,Arg),
    numbervars(Arg,N1,N2), numbervars(I1,N,Term,N2,N3).
```

# Howto Test for Variants

## Example

```

numbervars('$VAR'(N),N,N1) :- N1 is N+1.
numbervars(Term,N1,N2) :-
    nonvar(Term), functor(Term,Name,N),
    numbervars(0,N,Term,N1,N2).

numbervars(N,N,Term,N1,N1).
numbervars(I,N,Term,N1,N3) :-
    I < N, I1 is I+1, arg(I1,Term,Arg),
    numbervars(Arg,N1,N2), numbervars(I1,N,Term,N2,N3).

```

## Example

```

verify(Goal) :- \+ \+ Goal.
variant(Term1,Term2) :-
    verify((numbervars(Term1,0,N),
             numbervars(Term2,0,N),Term1=Term2)).

```

# Nondeterministic Programming

## Example

	0	1
$\rightarrow q_0$	$\{q_0, q_1\}$	$\{q_0\}$
$q_1$	$\emptyset$	$\{q_2\}$
$*q_2$	$\emptyset$	$\emptyset$

# Nondeterministic Programming

## Example

	0	1
$\rightarrow q_0$	$\{q_0, q_1\}$	$\{q_0\}$
$q_1$	$\emptyset$	$\{q_2\}$
$*q_2$	$\emptyset$	$\emptyset$

## Definition

A **NFA** is quintuple  $(Q, \Sigma, \Delta, I, F)$  such that

- 1  $Q$  is a set of states
- 2  $\Sigma$  is an alphabet
- 3  $\Delta$  is relation on  $(Q \times \Sigma) \times Q$
- 4  $I$  are the initial states
- 5  $F$  are the final states

## Example

```
accept(S) :-  
    initial(Q),  
    accept(Q,S).  
  
accept(Q, [X|Xs]) :-  
    delta(Q,X,Q1),  
    accept(Q1,Xs).  
  
accept(Q, []) :-  
    final(Q).
```

## Example

```
accept(S) :-  
    initial(Q),  
    accept(Q,S).  
  
accept(Q, [X|Xs]) :-  
    delta(Q,X,Q1),  
    accept(Q1,Xs).  
  
accept(Q, []) :-  
    final(Q).  
  
initial(q0).  
final(q2).
```

## Example

```
accept(S) :-  
    initial(Q),  
    accept(Q,S).  
  
accept(Q, [X|Xs]) :-  
    delta(Q,X,Q1),  
    accept(Q1,Xs).  
  
accept(Q, []) :-  
    final(Q).  
  
initial(q0).  
final(q2).  
  
delta(q0,0,q0).  
delta(q0,0,q1).  
delta(q0,1,q0).  
delta(q1,1,q2).
```



## Example

```
accept(S) :-  
    initial(Q),  
    accept(Q,S).  
  
accept(Q, [X|Xs]) :-  
    delta(Q,X,Q1),  
    accept(Q1,Xs).  
  
accept(Q, []) :-  
    final(Q).  
  
initial(q0).  
final(q2).  
  
delta(q0,0,q0).  
delta(q0,0,q1).  
delta(q0,1,q0).  
delta(q1,1,q2).  
  
:- accept([0,0,0,1,0,1]).
```

# Incomplete Data Structures

## Observation

given a list  $[1,2,3]$  it can be **represented** as the **difference** of two lists

$$\mathbf{1} \quad [1,2,3] = [1,2,3] \setminus []$$

# Incomplete Data Structures

## Observation

given a list  $[1,2,3]$  it can be **represented** as the **difference** of two lists

$$1 \quad [1,2,3] = [1,2,3] \setminus []$$

$$2 \quad [1,2,3] = [1,2,3,4,5] \setminus [4,5]$$

# Incomplete Data Structures

## Observation

given a list  $[1,2,3]$  it can be **represented** as the **difference** of two lists

$$1 \quad [1,2,3] = [1,2,3] \setminus []$$

$$2 \quad [1,2,3] = [1,2,3,4,5] \setminus [4,5]$$

$$3 \quad [1,2,3] = [1,2,3,8] \setminus [8]$$

# Incomplete Data Structures

## Observation

given a list  $[1,2,3]$  it can be **represented** as the **difference** of two lists

$$1 \quad [1,2,3] = [1,2,3] \setminus []$$

$$2 \quad [1,2,3] = [1,2,3,4,5] \setminus [4,5]$$

$$3 \quad [1,2,3] = [1,2,3,8] \setminus [8]$$

$$4 \quad [1,2,3] = [1,2,3|Xs] \setminus Xs$$

# Incomplete Data Structures

## Observation

given a list  $[1, 2, 3]$  it can be **represented** as the **difference** of two lists

$$1 \quad [1, 2, 3] = [1, 2, 3] \setminus []$$

$$2 \quad [1, 2, 3] = [1, 2, 3, 4, 5] \setminus [4, 5]$$

$$3 \quad [1, 2, 3] = [1, 2, 3, 8] \setminus [8]$$

$$4 \quad [1, 2, 3] = [1, 2, 3 | Xs] \setminus Xs$$

## Definition

the difference of two lists is denoted as  $As \setminus Bs$  and called **difference list**

# Incomplete Data Structures

## Observation

given a list  $[1,2,3]$  it can be **represented** as the **difference** of two lists

$$1 \quad [1,2,3] = [1,2,3] \setminus []$$

$$2 \quad [1,2,3] = [1,2,3,4,5] \setminus [4,5]$$

$$3 \quad [1,2,3] = [1,2,3,8] \setminus [8]$$

$$4 \quad [1,2,3] = [1,2,3|Xs] \setminus Xs$$

## Definition

the difference of two lists is denoted as  $As \setminus Bs$  and called **difference list**

## Example

```
append_dl(Xs \ Ys, Ys \ Zs, Xs \ Zs).
```

# Application of Difference Lists

## Recall

```
flatten([X|Xs],Ys) :-  
    flatten(X,Ys1), flatten(Xs,Ys2),  
    append(Ys1,Ys2,Ys).  
flatten(X,[X]) :- constant(X), X  $\neq$  [].  
flatten([],[]).
```



# Application of Difference Lists

## Recall

```
flatten([X|Xs],Ys) :-
    flatten(X,Ys1), flatten(Xs,Ys2),
    append(Ys1,Ys2,Ys).
flatten(X,[X]) :- constant(X), X ≠ [].
flatten([],[]).
```

## Example

```
flatten(Xs,Ys) :- flatten_dl(Xs,Ys \ []).
flatten_dl([X|Xs],Ys \ Zs) :-
    flatten_dl(X,Ys \ Ys1), flatten_dl(Xs,Ys1 \ Zs).
flatten_dl(X,[X|Xs] \ Xs) :- constant(X), X ≠ [].
flatten_dl([],Xs \ Xs).
```

## Difference Lists Implement Accumulators Top-Down

### Example (Flatten with Difference Lists)

```
flatten(Xs,Ys) :- flatten_dl(Xs,Ys \ []).  
flatten_dl([X|Xs],Ys \ Zs) :-  
    flatten_dl(X,Ys \ Ys1), flatten_dl(Xs,Ys1 \ Zs).  
flatten_dl(X,[X|Xs] \ Xs) :- constant(X), X ≠ [].  
flatten_dl([],Xs \ Xs).
```

## Difference Lists Implement Accumulators Top-Down

### Example (Flatten with Difference Lists)

```
flatten(Xs,Ys) :- flatten_dl(Xs,Ys \ []).
flatten_dl([X|Xs],Ys \ Zs) :-
    flatten_dl(X,Ys \ Ys1), flatten_dl(Xs,Ys1 \ Zs).
flatten_dl(X,[X|Xs] \ Xs) :- constant(X), X ≠ [].
flatten_dl([],Xs \ Xs).
```

### Example (Flatten Using Accumulator)

```
flatten(Xs,Ys) :- flatten(Xs,[],Ys).
flatten([X|Xs],Zs,Ys) :-
    flatten(Xs,Zs,Ys1), flatten(X,Ys1,Ys).
flatten(X,Xs,[X|Xs]) :-
    constant(X), X ≠ [].
flatten([],Xs,Xs).
```

## Example

```
reverse(Xs,Ys) :- reverse_dl(Xs, Ys \ []).  
reverse_dl([X|Xs], Ys \ Zs) :-  
    reverse_dl(Xs, Ys \ [X | Zs]).  
reverse_dl([], Xs \ Xs).
```

## Example

```
reverse(Xs,Ys) :- reverse_dl(Xs, Ys \ []).
reverse_dl([X|Xs], Ys \ Zs) :-
    reverse_dl(Xs, Ys \ [X | Zs]).
reverse_dl([], Xs \ Xs).
```

## Example

```
quicksort(Xs,Ys) :- quicksort_dl(Xs, Ys \ []).
quicksort_dl([X|Xs], Ys \ Zs) :-
    partition(Xs,X,Littles, Bigs),
    quicksort_dl(Littles,Ys \ [X|Ys1]),
    quicksort_dl(Bigs,Ys1 \ Zs).
quicksort_dl([], Xs \ Xs).
```

## Observations

- difference lists are effective if independently different sections of a list are built, which are then concatenated

## Observations

- difference lists are effective if independently different sections of a list are built, which are then concatenated
- the separation operator  $\backslash$  simplifies reading, but can be eliminated:  
“As  $\backslash$  Bs”  $\rightarrow$  “As , Bs”

## Observations

- difference lists are effective if independently different sections of a list are built, which are then concatenated
- the separation operator  $\backslash$  simplifies reading, but can be eliminated: “As  $\backslash$  Bs”  $\rightarrow$  “As , Bs”
- the explicit constructor should be removed, if time or space efficiency is an issue



## Observations

- difference lists are effective if independently different sections of a list are built, which are then concatenated
- the separation operator  $\backslash$  simplifies reading, but can be eliminated: “ $As \backslash Bs$ ”  $\rightarrow$  “ $As , Bs$ ”
- the explicit constructor should be removed, if time or space efficiency is an issue

## More Observations

- the tail  $Bs$  of a difference list acts like a pointer to the end of the first list  $As$

## Observations

- difference lists are effective if independently different sections of a list are built, which are then concatenated
- the separation operator  $\backslash$  simplifies reading, but can be eliminated: “ $As \backslash Bs$ ”  $\rightarrow$  “ $As, Bs$ ”
- the explicit constructor should be removed, if time or space efficiency is an issue

## More Observations

- the tail  $Bs$  of a difference list acts like a pointer to the end of the first list  $As$
- this works as  $As$  is an **incomplete** list

## Observations

- difference lists are effective if independently different sections of a list are built, which are then concatenated
- the separation operator  $\backslash$  simplifies reading, but can be eliminated: “ $As \backslash Bs$ ”  $\rightarrow$  “ $As , Bs$ ”
- the explicit constructor should be removed, if time or space efficiency is an issue

## More Observations

- the tail  $Bs$  of a difference list acts like a pointer to the end of the first list  $As$
- this works as  $As$  is an **incomplete** list
- thus we represent a concrete list as the difference of two incomplete data structures

## Observations

- difference lists are effective if independently different sections of a list are built, which are then concatenated
- the separation operator  $\backslash$  simplifies reading, but can be eliminated: “ $As \backslash Bs$ ”  $\rightarrow$  “ $As , Bs$ ”
- the explicit constructor should be removed, if time or space efficiency is an issue

## More Observations

- the tail  $Bs$  of a difference list acts like a pointer to the end of the first list  $As$
- this works as  $As$  is an **incomplete** list
- thus we represent a concrete list as the difference of two incomplete data structures
- generalises to other recursive data types

# Difference-structures

## Example

consider the following task: convert the sum  $(a + b) + (c + d)$  into  $(a + (b + (c + (d + 0))))$

# Difference-structures

## Example

consider the following task: convert the sum  $(a + b) + (c + d)$  into  $(a + (b + (c + (d + 0))))$

## Definition

we make use of **difference-sums**:  $E1++E2$ , where  $E1$ ,  $E2$  are incomplete; the empty sum is denoted by 0

# Difference-structures

## Example

consider the following task: convert the sum  $(a + b) + (c + d)$  into  $(a + (b + (c + (d + 0))))$

## Definition

we make use of **difference-sums**:  $E1 ++ E2$ , where  $E1$ ,  $E2$  are incomplete; the empty sum is denoted by 0

## Example

```
normalise(Exp, Norm) :- normalise_ds(Exp, Norm ++ 0).
normalise_ds(A+B, Norm ++ Space) :-
    normalise_ds(A, Norm ++ NormB),
    normalise_ds(B, NormB ++ Space).
normalise_ds(A, (A + Space) ++ Space) :-
    constant(A).
```

## Example

consider the following tasks

- create
- use
- maintain

a set of values indexed by keys



## Example

consider the following tasks

- create
- use
- maintain

a set of values indexed by keys

## Example

```
lookup(Key, [(Key, Value) | Dictionary], Value).  
lookup(Key, [(Key1, Value1) | Dictionary], Value) :-  
    Key  $\neq$  Key1,  
    lookup(Key, Dictionary, Value).  
  
:- Dict = [(arnold, 8881), (barry, 4513), (cathy, 5950) | Xs].
```

## Example

consider the following tasks

- create
- use
- maintain

a set of values indexed by keys

## Example

```
lookup(Key, [(Key, Value) | Dictionary], Value).
lookup(Key, [(Key1, Value1) | Dictionary], Value) :-
    Key  $\neq$  Key1,
    lookup(Key, Dictionary, Value).

:- Dict = [(arnold, 8881), (barry, 4513), (cathy, 5950) | Xs].
:- lookup(david, Dict, 1199).
Dict  $\mapsto$  [(arnold, 8881), (barry, 4513),
          (cathy, 5950), (david, 1199) | Xs]
```

## Example (Freeze and Melt)

```
copy(A,B) :- assert('$foo'(A)), retract('$foo'(B)).
```

## Example (Freeze and Melt)

```
copy(A,B) :- assert('$foo'(A)), retract('$foo'(B)).
```

```
freeze(A,B) :- copy(A,B), numbertvars(B,0,N).
```

## Example (Freeze and Melt)

```
copy(A,B) :- assert('$foo'(A)), retract('$foo'(B)).  
freeze(A,B) :- copy(A,B), numbervars(B,0,N).  
melt(A,B) :- melt(A,B,Dictionary), !.
```

## Example (Freeze and Melt)

```
copy(A,B) :- assert('$foo'(A)), retract('$foo'(B)).
freeze(A,B) :- copy(A,B), numbervars(B,0,N).
melt(A,B) :- melt(A,B,Dictionary), !.
melt('$VAR'(N),X,Dictionary) :- lookup(N,Dictionary,X).
melt(X,X,Dictionary) :- constant(X).
melt(X,Y,Dictionary) :-
    compound(X),
    functor(X,F,N),
    functor(Y,F,N),
    melt(N,X,Y,Dictionary).
```

## Example (Freeze and Melt)

```

copy(A,B) :- assert('$foo'(A)), retract('$foo'(B)).
freeze(A,B) :- copy(A,B), numbervars(B,0,N).
melt(A,B) :- melt(A,B,Dictionary), !.
melt('$VAR'(N),X,Dictionary) :- lookup(N,Dictionary,X).
melt(X,X,Dictionary) :- constant(X).
melt(X,Y,Dictionary) :-
    compound(X),
    functor(X,F,N),
    functor(Y,F,N),
    melt(N,X,Y,Dictionary).
melt(N,X,Y,Dictionary) :-
    N > 0, arg(N,X,ArgX),
    melt(ArgX,ArgY,Dictionary),
    arg(N,Y,ArgY), N1 is N-1,
    melt(N1,X,Y,Dictionary).
melt(0,X,Y,Dictionary).

```

# Context-Free Grammars

## Definition

a **grammar**  $G$  is a tuple  $G = (V, \Sigma, R, S)$ , where

- 1  $V$  finite set of **variables** (or **nonterminals**)
- 2  $\Sigma$  alphabet, the **terminal symbols**,  $V \cap \Sigma = \emptyset$
- 3  $R$  finite set of **rules**
- 4  $S \in V$  the **start symbol** of  $G$



# Context-Free Grammars

## Definition

a **grammar**  $G$  is a tuple  $G = (V, \Sigma, R, S)$ , where

- 1  $V$  finite set of **variables** (or **nonterminals**)
- 2  $\Sigma$  alphabet, the **terminal symbols**,  $V \cap \Sigma = \emptyset$
- 3  $R$  finite set of **rules**
- 4  $S \in V$  the **start symbol** of  $G$

a **rule** is a pair  $P \rightarrow Q$  of words, such that  $P, Q \in (V \cup \Sigma)^*$  and there is at least one variable in  $P$

# Context-Free Grammars

## Definition

a **grammar**  $G$  is a tuple  $G = (V, \Sigma, R, S)$ , where

- 1  $V$  finite set of **variables** (or **nonterminals**)
- 2  $\Sigma$  alphabet, the **terminal symbols**,  $V \cap \Sigma = \emptyset$
- 3  $R$  finite set of **rules**
- 4  $S \in V$  the **start symbol** of  $G$

a **rule** is a pair  $P \rightarrow Q$  of words, such that  $P, Q \in (V \cup \Sigma)^*$  and there is at least one variable in  $P$

## Definition

grammar  $G = (V, \Sigma, R, S)$  is **context-free**, if  $\forall$  rules  $P \rightarrow Q$ :

- 1  $P \in V$
- 2  $Q \in (V \cup \Sigma)^*$

## Example

sentence  $\rightarrow$  noun\_phrase, verb\_phrase.

noun\_phrase  $\rightarrow$  determiner, noun\_phrase2.

noun\_phrase  $\rightarrow$  noun\_phrase2.

noun\_phrase2  $\rightarrow$  adjective, noun\_phrase2.

noun\_phrase2  $\rightarrow$  noun.

verb\_phrase  $\rightarrow$  verb, noun\_phrase.

verb\_phrase  $\rightarrow$  verb.

determiner  $\rightarrow$  [the].

determiner  $\rightarrow$  [a].

noun  $\rightarrow$  [pie-plate].

noun  $\rightarrow$  [surprise].

adjective  $\rightarrow$  [decorated].

verb  $\rightarrow$  [contains].

sentence  $\stackrel{*}{\Rightarrow}$  ‘‘the decorated pie-plate contains a surprise’’

## Example

```

sentence(S \ S0) :- noun_phrase(S \ S1), verb_phrase(S1 \ S0).
noun_phrase(S \ S0) :-
    determiner(S \ S1), noun_phrase2(S1 \ S0).
noun_phrase(S) :- noun_phrase2(S).
noun_phrase2(S \ S0) :-
    adjective(S \ S1), noun_phrase2(S1 \ S0).
noun_phrase2(S) :- noun(S).
verb_phrase(S \ S0) :- verb(S \ S1), noun_phrase(S1 \ S0)
verb_phrase(S) :- verb(S).
determiner([the|S] \ S).
determiner([a|S] \ S).
noun([pie-plate|S] \ S).
noun([surprise|S] \ S).
adjective([decorated|S] \ S).
verb([contains|S] \ S).

```

## Extension: Add Parsetree

### Example

```
sentence(sentence(N,V), S \ S0) :-  
    noun_phrase(N, S \ S1),  
    verb_phrase(V, S1 \ S0).
```

## Extension: Add Parsetree

### Example

```
sentence(sentence(N,V), S \ S0) :-
    noun_phrase(N, S \ S1),
    verb_phrase(V, S1 \ S0).
```

### Example (Definite Clause Grammars)

```
sentence(sentence(N,V)) → noun_phrase(N), verb_phrase(V).
noun_phrase(np(D,N)) → determiner(D), noun_phrase2(N).
noun_phrase(np(N)) → noun_phrase2(N).
noun_phrase2(np2(A,N)) → adjective(A), noun_phrase2(N).
noun_phrase2(np2(N)) → noun(N).
verb_phrase(vp(V,N)) → verb(V), noun_phrase(N).
verb_phrase(vp(V)) → verb(V).
```

## Example

sentence(PT)  $\xRightarrow{*}$  ‘‘the decorated pie-plate contains a surprise’’

sentence(PT)  $\xRightarrow{*}$  ‘‘the decorated pie-plates contain a surprise’’

## Example

sentence(PT)  $\Rightarrow^*$  ‘‘the decorated pie-plate contains a surprise’’

sentence(PT)  $\Rightarrow^*$  ‘‘the decorated pie-plates contain a surprise’’

## Example

determiner(det(the))  $\rightarrow$  [the].

determiner(det(a))  $\rightarrow$  [a].

noun(noun(pie-plate))  $\rightarrow$  [pie-plate].

noun(noun(pie-plates))  $\rightarrow$  [pie-plates].

noun(noun(surprise))  $\rightarrow$  [surprise].

noun(noun(surprises))  $\rightarrow$  [surprises].

adjective(adj(decorated))  $\rightarrow$  [decorated].

verb(verb(contains))  $\rightarrow$  [contains].

verb(verb(contain))  $\rightarrow$  [contain].

sentence(PT)  $\Rightarrow^*$  ‘‘the decorated pie-plates contains a surprise’’



## Extension: Number Agreement

### Example

```
sentence(sentence(NP,VP),Num) →
    noun_phrase(N,Num), verb_phrase(V,Num).
```

```
⋮
```

```
determiner(det(the),Num) → [the].
```

```
determiner(det(a),singular) → [a].
```

```
noun(noun(pie-plate),singular) → [pie-plate].
```

```
noun(noun(pie-plates),plural) → [pie-plates].
```

```
noun(noun(surprise),singular) → [surprise].
```

```
noun(noun(surprises),plural) → [surprises].
```

```
adjective(adj(decorated)) → [decorated].
```

```
verb(verb(contains),singular) → [contains].
```

```
verb(verb(contain),plural) → [contain].
```

```
sentence(PT)  $\overset{*}{\Rightarrow}$  ‘‘the decorated pie-plates contain a surprise’’
```