

The formula

This is the proof of the following formula:

$$\neg \exists y (\forall z (\neg P(z,y) \vee \neg \exists x (P(z,x) \wedge P(x,z)) \wedge \exists x (P(z,x) \wedge P(x,z)) \vee P(z,y)))$$

The NNF and Clausal Forms

The skolemized Negation Normal Form of the negated input:

$$\neg A(\beta,a()) \vee \neg A(\beta,\gamma) \vee \neg A(\gamma,\beta) \wedge A(\beta,b(\beta)) \vee A(\beta,a()) \wedge A(b(\beta),\beta) \vee A(\beta,a())$$

The corresponding clausal form:

$$\{ \neg A(\gamma,\beta), \neg A(\beta,\gamma), \neg A(\beta,a()) \}, \{ A(\beta,a()), A(\beta,b(\beta)) \}, \{ A(b(\beta),\beta), A(\beta,a()) \}$$

The proof

$$\frac{\{ \neg A(\gamma,\beta), \neg A(\beta,\gamma), \neg A(\beta,a()) \}}{\{ \neg A(\gamma,\beta), \neg A(\beta,\gamma), \neg A(\beta,a()) \}} \text{ ax}$$

$$\frac{\{ \neg A(\gamma,\beta), \neg A(\beta,\gamma), \neg A(\beta,a()) \}}{\{ \neg A(b(a()), a()) \}} \text{ ax}$$

$$\frac{\{ A(\beta,b(\beta)), \neg A(\beta,a()), \neg A(a(),\beta) \}}{\{ A(a(),b(a())), \neg A(a(),a()) \}} \text{ res } \sigma_4$$

$$\frac{\{ A(a(),b(a())), \neg A(a(),a()) \}}{\{ A(a(),b(a())) \}} \text{ res } \sigma_1$$

$$\frac{\{ A(\beta,a()), A(\beta,b(\beta)) \}}{\{ A(\beta,a()), A(\beta,b(\beta)) \}} \text{ ax}$$

$$\frac{\{ A(\beta,a()), A(\beta,b(\beta)) \}}{\{ A(\beta,a()), A(\beta,b(\beta)) \}} \text{ res } \sigma_2$$

$$\frac{\{ \neg A(\gamma,\beta), \neg A(\beta,\gamma), \neg A(\beta,a()) \}}{\{ \neg A(\gamma,\beta), \neg A(\beta,\gamma), \neg A(\beta,a()) \}} \text{ ax}$$

$$\frac{\{ \neg A(\gamma,\beta), \neg A(\beta,\gamma), \neg A(\beta,a()) \}}{\{ A(b(a()), a()), \neg A(a(), a()) \}} \text{ res } \sigma_6$$

$$\frac{\{ A(b(\beta),\beta), A(\beta,a()) \}}{\{ A(b(\beta),\beta), A(\beta,a()) \}} \text{ ax}$$

$$\frac{\{ A(b(\beta),\beta), A(\beta,a()) \}}{\{ A(b(a()), a()), \neg A(a(), a()) \}} \text{ res } \sigma_5$$

$$\frac{\{ A(b(a()), a()), \neg A(a(), a()) \}}{\{ A(b(a()), a()) \}} \sigma_0$$

$$\square$$

The substitutions

$$\sigma_0=\{\}$$
$$\sigma_1=\{\gamma \mapsto a(), \beta \mapsto b(a())\}$$
$$\sigma_2=\{\beta \mapsto a()\}$$
$$\sigma_3=\{\beta \mapsto a()\}$$
$$\sigma_4=\{\gamma \mapsto a()\}$$
$$\sigma_5=\{\beta \mapsto a()\}$$
$$\sigma_6=\{\gamma \mapsto a(), \beta \mapsto a()\}$$